Pupil Disaffection in Areas of Socio-economic Disadvantage: implications for effective school leadership

Dr Norma Lloyd-Nesling

Background and Method
This paper examines specific elements of a much wider study that attempted to ascertain the reasons for under-achievement in a large comprehensive school in the Welsh valleys. Specific academic performance at G.C.S.E. level was poor in Randall, the main case school, in relation to other schools with similar socio-economic problems particularly in Tregarn Valley. Between 1980 and 1993 academic attainment had fallen from 47% to just 9% of pupils achieving five grades A*-C at G.C.S.E. level indicating that the school was unquestionably failing to reach the Government National Education and Training Targets, Foundation Target 1.

The majority of schools in CA1 (LEA) suffered similar social and economic problems brought about by the mass closure of the collieries in the latter half of the 1980s, but were achieving better results than Randall where pupil wastage and truancy were still an on-going problem. To address these issues and ascertain the extent of disaffection and lack of achievement in Randall I felt that, in the first instance, it was important to provide an overview of patterns of attendance, examination results, post 16 destinations and unemployment across Wales, particularly in the district known as Career Area 1 which consisted of five valleys in close proximity to Tregarn. A quantitative survey of Years 10 and 11 pupils was also conducted in five Tregarn schools over a period of four academic years from 1992/93 to 1995/96.

Over the four year in-depth study, and beyond, examination results in Randall continued to improve. By 2000 the pass rate had risen to 32% but this figure also included a substantial number of pupils engaged in G.N.V.Q. equivalent courses. However, they did not catch up with other schools in Tregarn who were also producing better results. Disaffection appeared to be increasing throughout the school. From informal conversations with pupils of various abilities it seemed that many of them did not value education and had little desire to succeed. This presented a conundrum for me and the staff in Randall. Why should it be that pupils in Randall were performing poorly in terms of examination performance especially in a brand new, purpose-built school with excellent facilities? Moreover, why were Randall pupils achieving at lower levels than those in other schools in the locality with inferior facilities? Firstly, was it connected with intra-school factors such as school ethos, school organisation, pupil alienation, etc? Secondly, was it the result of socio-economic elements such as lack of work in Tregarn, as a whole? Thirdly, were Randall families subject to the ‘ecological fallacy’ and, therefore, experiencing greater unemployment and poverty within the existing poor social conditions in the community in which the school was situated? Fourthly, was it family background and lack of parental support for the values and aims of the school? It was these circumstances that impelled me to investigate the views of pupils in all five secondary schools in Tregarn Valley. The aims of the study were:

a. to investigate the relationship between unemployment, lack of academic achievement and disaffection;
b. to discover whether parental support was a factor in the ‘opt-out’ mentality;
c. to explore the relationship between the curriculum offered and perceived needs of pupils, school organisation, intra-school factors, etc;
d. to clarify the link between absenteeism, examination performance and school;
e. to examine the influence of the predominant culture in Randall and Tregarn Valley.

As the research progressed it was obvious to me...
that there were multi-causal reasons for disaffection and lack of attainment in the main case school. However, in this particular paper I will concentrate on the effects of unemployment, truancy and school organisation.

From the data accumulated it was apparent that absenteeism was evident in all schools across the principality. The all-Wales figures remained fairly consistent with all-absences between 11% and 11.1% and unauthorised absences between 1.6% and 1.7% between 1993/94 and 1995/96 (Table 1a). Truancy was a problem throughout CA1 but figures varied more between schools than between districts. The L.E.A. rates reduced from 13% to 12.5% all-absences between 1993/94 and 1995/96 with no significant trend in unauthorised absences which fluctuated slightly between 2.3% and 2.5%. Table 1b shows that there was a continued downward trend for both types of absences for all schools in Tregarn until 1999/2000, but it can be clearly seen that figures for Randall were higher than the other four schools with a worrying level of unauthorised absences. However, recorded attendance in all schools was not necessarily ‘bottoms on seats’ because of the range of marks allowed for absent pupils. In addition, there was no evidence to determine whether all schools adhered rigidly to the official criteria.

Strenuous efforts were made in Randall to stem truancy but authorised absence marks were much abused by parents. Trivial reasons were given for absences or sick notes sent to school which had to be accepted by staff including holidays in term time as highlighted by Le Riche (1992) and Meickle (1993). The problems were more deep-seated than at first perceived. One could speculate that absenteeism was both cause and effect of disaffection and under-achievement in Randall. This was a concrete factor for the implications of the conclusion to my study. However, viewed in isolation this did not provide an explanation for disaffection in this school.

The evidence suggested that truancy and absenteeism were linked to problems in the community. Some parents exerted a negative attitude to the school rather than a positive influence to ensure good attendance. A number of researchers such as Keys and Fernandes ((1993), Plummer (2000), Kinder, et.al. (1999) and Mclaughlin (2000) suggested that the relationship between school, parents and the community was vital in stemming truancy and disaffection.

**Examination Performance**

Reynolds (1992) suggested that schools with a high proportion of less-able pupils would have problems competing in the academic success stakes. He argued that intake of pupils inevitably plays a crucial part in academic orientation and success. Nonetheless, Randall was performing worse than schools in CA1 and Tregarn with similar numbers of less-able pupils, those receiving free school meals and comparable unemployment problems. Even given a new school, on the same site, and state of the art facilities in 1991 Randall was failing to stem truancy which was having a negative effect on examination performance. Between 1992/93 and 1995/96 pupil performance for five G.C.S.E. A* - C grades increased across Wales from 37% to 42% with girls achieving higher than boys similarly for A* - G. The data revealed that

| Table 1a: Percentage Rates of Absence in Tregarn Valley Schools 1993/94 - 1996/97 |
|------------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| Randall          | 17.9     | 8        | 18.7     | 9.7      | 15.6     | 5.3      | 14.6     | 4.9      |
| Searles          | 15.5     | 2.4      | 11.3     | 1.3      | 11.6     | 0.9      | 12.1     | 1.4      |
| Penne            | 11.8     | 2        | 12.6     | 2.8      | 11.5     | 1.4      | 9.7      | 1.1      |
| Napier           | 12.5     | 0.9      | 12       | 0.2      | 11.9     | 0        | 12.1     | 0.2      |
| Bish.Bon.        | 9        | 0.1      | 9        | 0.2      | 9        | 0.4      | 8.6      | 0.5      |
| L.E.A.           | 13       | 2.3      | 12.8     | 2.5      | 12.5     | 2.4      | 11.1     | 1.9      |
| WALES            | 11       | 1.7      | 11.1     | 1.7      | 11       | 1.6      | 10.2     | 1.5      |

N.B. Source: Table 1a (Welsh Office)
N.B. Schools in individual areas have been allocated pseudonyms to preserve confidentiality.
N.B. L.E.A. Post 1995 figures are for re-organised unitary authority consisting of Tregarn, Raenbach and Throswell.
substantially more pupils were sitting public examinations in CA1 than across Wales as a whole but the failure rate for CA1 indicated a worrying trend. It can be seen from Table 2 that, although there was some fluctuation, examination performance also increased in other Tregarn schools. Randall’s performance had increased admirably from 9% to 25% grades A* - C, for boys and girls, culminating in the school improvement award. Much of the improvement in boys’ performance in Randall was due to policies implemented to target and upgrade their performance. Statistics indicate that academic attainment continued to improve across Wales, the L.E.A. and in Tregarn Valley until 2000 when the Welsh Assembly Government discontinued publication of examination results. However, it can be clearly perceived that even with considerable improvement Randall still lagged way

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1b: Percentage Rates of Absence in Tregarn Valley Schools 1997/98 - 1999/2000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Randall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Searles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Napier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bish.Bon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.E.A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WALES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N.B. Source: Table 1b (Welsh Assembly Government Office)  NIR = No information returned.
N.B. L.E.A. Post 1995 figures are for re-organised unitary authority consisting of Tregan, Raenbach and Throswell.
N.B. Schools in individual areas have been allocated pseudonyms to preserve confidentiality.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Randall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Searles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Napier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bish.Bon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.E.A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WALES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N.B. The L.E.A. triple figures for 1995/96 represent Tregarn, Raenbach and Throswell after re-organisation into unitary authorities. The single figure represents Maerdin, Vonderi and Gybson.
behind the other four schools in terms of achievement, although this needs to be viewed in the light of the size of the schools. Randall had considerably more pupils than the other schools in Tregarn. For example, in 1995 Randall had 208 pupils on roll compared with 124, 146, 119 and 123 for Searles, Penne, Napier and Bishop Boniface respectively but fewer examination entries than the other schools even though it had an open entry policy. By 2000 96% of pupils were entered for at least one C.O.E., G.C.S.E. or G.C.S.E. short course but the number achieving at least five grades A* - C was well below the L.E.A. percentage. Benn and Chitty (1996) maintained that though some of the schools in their research had similar catchment areas, and range of pupil ability, that the ‘outcomes’ were different depending on school organisation, pedagogical methods and the social structure, as well as other factors such as home background. These aspects clearly warranted further investigation.

Unemployment

Previous research I had conducted between 1977-1980 on teachers’ perspectives on under-achievement had cited unemployment as the main cause of disaffection. Informal conversations with staff in other schools highlighted the view that, fifteen years on some truancy was still due to unemployment for pupils and their families and that it was a crucial indicator of poor examination performance. However, unemployment for youths and adults had improved throughout the 1980s and continued to improve during the period of my research. Unemployment decreased across Wales from 14.3% in October 1983 to 8.9% in January 1996. In Tregarn Valley rates were not available but the corresponding figures for each district within CA1 saw a concomitant decrease in the figures for unemployed claimants. Unemployment for youths aged 16 to 18 years fell in Tregarn from 20.8% in October 1983 to 5.2% in January 1996 (Table 3).

Much of this was disguised unemployment because of the reluctant return to school of sixteen year olds who were unable to claim benefits. In addition, there is no indication whether employment was temporary, casual or long-term permanent. Some training schemes effectively took claimants off the unemployment register, temporarily, with no ‘real’ jobs at the conclusion of their training. There would also be those of working age who were economically inactive and withdrawn from the labour market. For example, early retirement, sickness and disability would also need to be taken into account. Unemployment continued to fall consistently across Wales from 5.5% overall in January 1997 to 2.9% in January 2003. Within the unitary authority in which Tregarn was situated unemployment fell from 5.3% in January 1997 to 2.6% in January 2003.

After local government re-organisation in 1995 Tregarn became part of the new unitary authority composed of Tregarn, Raenbach and Throswell. Separate information for those aged 16 to 18 years was not available but the statistics in Table 4 show quite clearly that unemployment for those of working age continued to decrease within the authority and across Wales to July 2003.

When I started my research I had thought that unemployment was the major factor preventing young people in Randall from achieving academic success, but as the research progressed the evidence suggested that there was a combination of external and intra-school factors which contributed to under-achievement. What was evident was that all the schools in Tregarn and across the L.E.A. suffered the same socio-economic problems as Randall families but generally had a higher success rate at examination level. Given the similarity of background it was puzzling why Randall pupils were performing less well

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3: Youth Unemployment in Tregarn and Cai</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct. 1983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct. 1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct. 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct. 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct. 1990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oct. 1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan. 1996</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
area experienced greater unemployment than others. The evidence in the quantitative data seems to suggest that Randall families were exposed to the ‘ecological fallacy’. There were substantial pockets of unemployment in poor and deprived areas.

Social deprivation was rife throughout the valley, but it was more concentrated in larger council estates with greater evidence of drugs, petty crime, and a benefits lifestyle than the rest of Tregarn. Families on these estates suffered social exclusion (Page (2000) thus it was more difficult for individuals to exit unemployment in this kind of situation. Often work is found through ‘word of mouth’ from employed friends and relatives. As mentioned earlier if the majority are unemployed then they will be consumed by a benefits lifestyle with all its accompanying social and economic problems Hannan (1998). Subsequently, this work ethic will be transmitted to their children who will adopt similar lifestyles.

Unemployment in the Catchment Area of Randall

Long term unemployment fosters problems in the community. Children from these families will adopt the mores and attitudes of their particular backgrounds. For them being in work was not necessarily employment in a real sense but often low-level, part-time work such as cleaning windows or casual labouring. Unemployment due to the ‘ecological fallacy’ was greater for Randall families than the Unemployment Services Information Unit official statistics suggested, because it was routinely disguised by adult training schemes which never materialised into full-time jobs.

Socio-economic factors such as lack of work with some pupils’ parents experiencing third generation unemployment were instrumental in pupils opting-out of the school system from as early as Year 9. The evidence suggests that unemployment might give some explanation for disaffection in Randall, but it does not complete the picture nor does it give a clear rationalisation for under-achievement.

Table 4: Unemployment Rates 1997–2003 - New Unitary Authority - Proportion of Resident Age Population Estimates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unit. Auth.</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WALES</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N. B. Rates were unavailable for the old authority but unemployment decreased from 17,236 to 8,537 between January 1997 and July 2003.
School Organisation and Corporate Identity

After years of a dictatorial style of management staff felt that the new, internally appointed head teacher could only be an improvement. They were optimistic that it would raise staff morale, ameliorate the general atmosphere and provide an impetus for overall improvement. This, in turn, would improve the general work ethos of the school with a concomitant rise in standards of attainment. However, after an initial sense of euphoria teacher morale plummeted. Staff felt under-valued, had no sense of being cared for as individuals, with little experience of personal development for the majority. Bennett, Crawford and Cartwright (2003). Macbeath (1998) argued the importance of the head teacher managing, ‘not from the apex of the pyramid but from the centre of the web of human relationships’. This was the situation in Randall where negotiation was considered to be a cosmetic exercise. Most decisions were made by senior management prior to debate and were considered irrevocable as cited by one of the head teacher's in Day, et.al. (2000). This created a sense of despair and apathy throughout the school.

As a teacher/researcher I was aware that many staff felt that the head teacher was not supportive and ineffectual in setting clear guide lines in terms of pupils’ codes of dress and disruptive behaviour. Adherence to written school rules was minimal causing confusion for teachers and pupils. Neither was he considered forceful enough with parents when it came to confrontations between pupils and teachers with little consistency in his approach. Staff felt that discipline and codes of behaviour were deteriorating in the school that had an overall effect on examination performance. This view is supported by the research into discipline of Hunter (1991), Bowe and Ball (1992) and Glover (1992). Staff retreated more and more into their own cliques. Like the pupils they had become fragmented, lacked cohesion, had low expectations, experienced an overload of innovations and had no sense of belonging to the school as they had in the past. Randall balanced precariously between a ‘stuck school’ and a ‘wandering school’ (p.55) Bush and Coleman (2000).

As Riding and Butterfield (1990) suggested, some pupils find the curriculum as being irrelevant to their needs as they perceived them, that is, preparation for the world of work. My article in ‘Take Care Mr. Blunkett’ (1998) questioned the wisdom of forcing pupils to study subjects, at the expense of those in which they excelled. Indeed, as in most schools, the National Curriculum was a strait-jacket for non-academic pupils in Randall. School structures such as changing the time of lunch breaks to accommodate examinations’ changes plus a more complex, two week timetable resulted in confusion for staff and pupils. The truncated lunch-break had resulted in cessation of lunch-time clubs and activities. Pupils played the timetable to their own advantage and had no sense of urgency to reach lessons on time.

Levels of discipline varied from teacher to teacher as in most schools. Some younger members of staff experienced problems, because they had a tendency to be more informal with pupils allowing them to cross the line from sociability to familiarity which often led to disruption in classes. Some young people on KS4 courses displayed a ‘couldn’t care less’ attitude even with potential employers who came into the school to interview them. This was exacerbated by confusion over lines of discipline. Rigid demarcation of responsibilities was zealously guarded, particularly the roles of heads of year (formerly Year Tutors), who regarded discipline as part of their pastoral responsibility rather than it being a whole-school issue.

Since my earlier research there had been a significant loss of elements such as corporate identity and spirit in Randall which were considered to be ‘naff’ by large groups of pupils. Generally, young people in Randall had no sense of belonging, no pride in the school, no sense of identity or corporate spirit or, in a broader sense, in the community. It could be argued that all these factors were inextricably bound in the manifestation of an ‘opt-out’ mentality which fostered low attainment. Glover, Cartwright and Gleeson (1998) argued that lack of corporate spirit was instrumental in disaffection. They purported that a whole-school sense of belonging is important to create a positive attitude in pupils. However, most whole-school activities and competitiveness had disappeared from Randall.

St David’s Day, the house system, whole school sports days, charitable functions and Christmas activities had been discontinued because it would take time out of lessons. The result was that attendance during the last week of the Christmas term deteriorated considerably with a total absence of joy and celebration of the season. The parent-teacher association was virtually defunct as was the prefect system. This lack of corporate identity appeared to be one of the missing components in Randall towards achieving academic success. Menter, et. al. (1995) suggested that the role of a head teacher had moved inexorably from that of an ‘educational leader paternalistic/community-servant’ to a purveyor of education, (p.12.) Generally, supportive parents, pupils, staff and the community suffered from a loss of corporate spirit due to the head’s market-led approach to education.

Another significant factor was the ‘them’ and ‘us’ attitude of pupils and staff. The general opinion was that pupils and parents were somehow different from those in other schools which calls into question Saunders’ view (1996) who thought it was possible to
The school leadership should aim to:

- implement measures to stem disaffection and encourage parents and the wider community to feel part of the school process;
- ensure that parental visits to school are not always for punitive reasons;
- aim for more stability in school structures such as timings for lunch;
- ensure consistency in lines of demarcation in terms of how pupils present themselves along with their general demeanour in the school;
- engage senior pupils in understanding their position as role models and re-introduce the prefect system to provide opportunity for autonomy to foster self discipline and responsibility for their own learning and standards of behaviour;
- introduce and foster the concept of life-long learning;
- encourage responsible involvement in the day to day life of the school with shared visions, goals, high expectations and clear aims within a positive ethos;
- insidious verbal bullying employed by Randall pupils needs to be addressed to counteract under-achievement;
- consistency across staff in terms of approach, discipline and a realisation of pupils’ true ability is paramount;
- a refusal to accept poor quality work from pupils as all they are capable of producing;
- instigate measures to raise negative thinking from ‘I can’t’ or ‘I won’t’ to a more positive ethos of ‘I can’ and ‘I will’;
- develop the notion of the school as a community to foster a sense of belonging; not to ‘the school’ but ‘our school’;
- develop social skills, courtesy, self discipline, modes of speech, respect for themselves, their peers and the wider community;
- inculcate a sense of pride and purpose in being pupil in Randall to build on a firm, positive work ethic and raise achievement;
- employ the ‘spurter’ theory to raise aspirations and emphasise that they are not different from pupils in other schools;
- pupils wear their under-achievement like a badge of pride - replace this with positive emblems for constructive thinking and responsibility for their own work ethic;
- pupils are streetwise but they are not learner-wise - they must become learner-wise to identify with and engage in the learning process;
- pupils must identify with success instead of failure.

The research showed that unemployment, truancy, school organisation and intra school factors such as loss of corporate spirit, etc., played a vital part in under-achievement but it also revealed that other complex elements were at work which acted as a lever for disaffection and under-achievement. Socio-economic problems, family background, parents’ poor standard of education, weak parental support for the school, the prevalence of the ‘ecological fallacy’, pupil alienation, negative peer pressure in the form of verbal bullying, inside and outside the school, and a community deficit all contributed to disaffection, low aspirations and poor academic performance.

Generally, from informal conversations with staff, it appeared that the consensus of opinion was that there was a danger of able, academic youngsters eventually suffering as a result of the focus on the disaffected in terms of human and financial resources. This focus did not address intra-school problems such as verbal bullying.
Randall can do little to stem socio-economic problems in the community such as unemployment or family background nor can it solve the disintegration of society in terms of drugs, alcohol and crime. However, effective school leadership can attempt to tackle intra-school problems such as behaviour in lessons, attitudes to learning, school organisation, nurturing of corporate spirit and identity, etc.

A consistent leadership approach to problems within the school organisation also needed to be addressed for effective whole-school improvement. Some pupils were rooted in the same cycle of disaffection as their parents large numbers of whom had attended the school. The sad fact to emerge was the extent of disaffection and the poor work ethic that had also permeated the top bands and the more academic pupils either as victim or as perpetrator of truancy and under-achievement.

Some staff also needed to address their own prejudices regarding their perceived view of pupils’ ability. This will not be easy given the unresponsive and indifferent attitude of large groups of young people and their parents. To successfully compete with the best schools Randall pupils must adopt a more pro-school culture.

This can only be achieved if the school leadership recognises its own failure to address vitally important, whole-school issues. In the final analysis educational research on school leadership can have very little effect unless the theoretical conclusions are implemented for the benefit of the day to day transition of knowledge from the classroom teacher into effective, successful modes of learning for young people.

Footnotes
1 Pseudonyms used in this study: CA1 – (Career Area 1) composed of six valleys – Maerdin, Raenbach, Throswell, Vonderi, Gybson, Tregarn – valley in which Randall (main case school)) Searles, Penne, Napier, Bishop Boniface were situated.
2 The new unitary authority consisted of Tregarn, Raenbach and Throswell Valleys.

Abbreviated References
Learning Partnership Inter Agency Development Programme, NFER, Slough.


